

§4.17: STRONG NULLSTELLENSATZ

**STRONG NULLSTELLENSATZ:** Let  $K$  be an algebraically closed field, and  $R = K[X_1, \dots, X_n]$  be a polynomial ring. Let  $I \subseteq R$  be an ideal and  $f \in R$  a polynomial. Then

$f$  vanishes at every point of  $\mathcal{Z}(I)$  if and only if  $f \in \sqrt{I}$ .

**DEFINITION:** Let  $K$  be a field and  $R = K[X_1, \dots, X_n]$ . A **subvariety** of  $K^n$  is a set of the form  $\mathcal{Z}(S)$  for some set of polynomials  $S \subseteq R$ ; i.e., a solution set of some system of polynomial equations.

**COROLLARY:** Let  $K$  be an algebraically closed field. There is a bijection

$$\{\text{radical ideals in } K[X_1, \dots, X_n]\} \longleftrightarrow \{\text{subvarieties of } K^n\}.$$

**(1) Proof of Strong Nullstellensatz:**

**(a)** Show that  $\mathcal{Z}(I) = \mathcal{Z}(\sqrt{I})$ , and deduce the  $(\Leftarrow)$  direction.

**(b)** Let  $Y$  be an extra indeterminate. Show that  $f$  vanishes on  $\mathcal{Z}(I)$  implies that

$$\mathcal{Z}(I + (Yf - 1)) = \emptyset \quad \text{in } K^{n+1}.$$

**(c)** What does the Nullstellensatz have to say about that?

**(d)** Apply the  $R$ -algebra homomorphism  $\phi : R[Y] \rightarrow \text{frac}(R)$  given by  $\phi(Y) = \frac{1}{f}$  and clear denominators.

**(a)** Since  $I \subseteq \sqrt{I}$ , we have  $\mathcal{Z}(\sqrt{I}) \subseteq \mathcal{Z}(I)$ . On the other hand, if  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(I)$  and  $f^n \in I$ , then  $f^n(\alpha) = 0$ , so  $f(\alpha) = 0$ , so  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(\sqrt{I})$ . In particular, the  $(\Leftarrow)$  direction of the statement holds.

**(b)** If there was a solution  $(\alpha, a)$ , this would mean  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(I)$  and  $af(\alpha) - -1 = 0$ , so  $f(\alpha) \neq 0$ , contradicting that  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(f)$ .

**(c)** We can write  $1 = \sum_i r_i(\underline{X}, Y)g_i(\underline{X}) + s(\underline{X}, Y)(Yf(\underline{X}) - 1)$  for some  $r_i, s \in R[Y]$  and  $g_i \in I$ .

**(d)** We get  $1 = \sum_i r_i(\underline{X}, 1/f)g_i(\underline{X}) + s(\underline{X}, 1/f)(1/f \cdot f(\underline{X}) - 1)$ . The last term dies so  $1 = \sum_i r_i(\underline{X}, 1/f)g_i(\underline{X})$ . We can clear denominators to get  $f^n = \sum r'_i(\underline{X})g_i(\underline{X})$  in  $R$ , so  $f^n \in I$ .

**(2) Strong Nullstellensatz warmup:**

**(a)** Consider the ideal  $I = (X^2 + Y^2) \in \mathbb{R}[X, Y]$  and  $f = X$ . Discuss the hypotheses and conclusion of Strong Nullstellensatz in this example.

**(b)** Show that<sup>1</sup> no power of  $F = X^2 + Y^2 + Z^2$  is in the ideal

$$I = (X^3 - Y^2Z, Y^7 - XZ^3, 3X^5 - XYZ - 2Z^{19}) \quad \text{in the ring } \mathbb{C}[X, Y, Z].$$

**(a)**  $\mathcal{Z}(I) = \{(0, 0)\}$  and  $X$  vanishes along  $\mathcal{Z}(I)$ , but  $(X^2 + Y^2)$  is prime and hence radical. The conclusion of Strong Nullstellensatz fails. Of course,  $\mathbb{R}$  is not algebraically closed.

**(b)**  $F(1, 1, 1) = 3 \neq 0$  but  $(1, 1, 1) \in \mathcal{Z}(I)$ , since it is in the zero-set of each generator.

**(3) Prove the Corollary.**

<sup>1</sup>Hint: You just need to find one point. *One, one, one...*

We have a map from radical ideals to subvarieties given by  $I \mapsto \mathcal{Z}(I)$ . This is surjective by definition and the first part of the proof of Strong Nullstellensatz. It is injective too: if  $I$  and  $J$  are distinct radical ideals, without loss of generality there is some  $f \in J$  such that  $f \notin \sqrt{I}$ ; then  $f(\alpha) \neq 0$  for some  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(I)$ , so  $\mathcal{Z}(I) \not\subseteq \mathcal{Z}(J)$ .

- (4) Let  $R = \mathbb{C}[T]$  be a polynomial ring. In this problem, we will show that the ideal of  $\mathbb{C}$ -algebraic relations on the elements  $\{T^2, T^3, T^4\}$  is  $I = (X_1^2 - X_3, X_2^2 - X_1X_3)$ .
- (a) Let  $\phi : \mathbb{C}[X_1, X_2, X_3] \rightarrow \mathbb{C}[T]$  be the  $\mathbb{C}$ -algebra map  $X_1 \mapsto T^2, X_2 \mapsto T^3, X_3 \mapsto T^4$ . Show that  $I \subseteq \ker(\phi)$ .
- (b) Show that  $\mathcal{Z}(I) \subseteq \{(\lambda^2, \lambda^3, \lambda^4) \in \mathbb{C}^3 \mid \lambda \in \mathbb{C}\} \subseteq \mathcal{Z}(\ker(\phi))$ , and deduce that  $\ker(\phi) \subseteq \sqrt{I}$ .
- (c) Show that  $I$  is prime<sup>2</sup>, and complete the proof.

- (a) The generators map to 0 under  $\phi$ .
- (b) For the first containment, let  $(\alpha, \beta, \gamma) \in \mathcal{Z}(I)$ . From the first equation, we can write  $\gamma = \alpha^2$ . From the second, we have  $\beta^2 = \alpha^3$ . If  $\alpha = 0$ , we must have  $(0, 0, 0)$ . Otherwise,  $\alpha$  has two square roots. Take  $\lambda$  to be one of these. Then  $\alpha = \lambda^2$  and  $\beta^2 = \lambda^6$ . This means  $\beta = \pm\lambda^3$ . If  $\beta = -\lambda^3$ , replace  $\lambda$  by  $-\lambda$ ; this does not change  $\alpha = \lambda^2$  or  $\gamma = \lambda^4$ . So, we obtain  $\lambda$  such that  $(\alpha, \beta, \gamma) = (\lambda^2, \lambda^3, \lambda^4)$ .  
For the second, if  $F(X_1, X_2, X_3) \in \ker(\phi)$ , then  $F(T^2, T^3, T^4) = 0$ , so  $F(\lambda^2, \lambda^3, \lambda^4) = 0$ .
- (c) Using the first relation and an isomorphism theorem,  $\mathbb{C}[X_1, X_2, X_3]/I \cong \mathbb{C}[X_1, X_2]/(X_2^2 - X_1^3)$ . The element  $X_2^2 - X_1^3$  is irreducible by Eisenstein's criterion, so  $I$  is prime.

- (5) Let  $K$  be an algebraically closed field and  $R = K \begin{bmatrix} X_{11} & X_{12} \\ X_{21} & X_{22} \end{bmatrix}$  be a polynomial ring. Use the Strong Nullstellensatz to show that any polynomial  $F(X_{11}, X_{12}, X_{21}, X_{22})$  that vanishes on every matrix of rank at most one is a multiple of  $\det \begin{bmatrix} X_{11} & X_{12} \\ X_{21} & X_{22} \end{bmatrix}$ .

- (6) We say that a subvariety of  $K^n$  is **irreducible** if it cannot be written as a union of two proper subvarieties. Show that the bijection from the Corollary restricts to a bijection

$$\{\text{prime ideals in } K[X_1, \dots, X_n]\} \longleftrightarrow \{\text{irreducible subvarieties of } K^n\}.$$

Let  $I$  be a radical ideal. We need to show that  $\mathcal{Z}(I)$  is irreducible if and only if  $I$  is prime.

Suppose that  $I$  is not prime, so one has  $f, g \notin I$  with  $fg \in I$ . Since  $I$  is radical,  $f, g \notin \sqrt{I}$ , so  $\mathcal{Z}(f), \mathcal{Z}(g) \not\supseteq \mathcal{Z}(I)$ . This means that  $\mathcal{Z}(I + (f))$  and  $\mathcal{Z}(I + (g))$  are proper subvarieties of  $\mathcal{Z}(I)$ . But  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(I)$  and  $fg \in I$  implies  $f(\alpha)g(\alpha) = 0$  so  $f(\alpha) = 0$  or  $g(\alpha) = 0$ , which means  $\mathcal{Z}(I) = \mathcal{Z}(I + (f)) \cup \mathcal{Z}(I + (g))$ .

Conversely, suppose that  $\mathcal{Z}(I) = \mathcal{Z}(J_1) \cup \mathcal{Z}(J_2)$ , with  $J_1, J_2$  radical and not equal to  $I$ . Since  $\mathcal{Z}(I) \supseteq \mathcal{Z}(J_i)$  we have  $J_i \not\supseteq I$ . We can take  $f \in J_1 \setminus J_2$  and  $g \in J_2 \setminus J_1$ . Since  $f(\alpha) = 0$  for all  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(J_1)$ ,  $g(\alpha) = 0$  for all  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(J_2)$ , and  $\mathcal{Z}(I) = \mathcal{Z}(J_1) \cup \mathcal{Z}(J_2)$ , we have  $fg(\alpha) = 0$  for all  $\alpha \in \mathcal{Z}(I)$ , so  $fg \in I$ , and  $I$  is not prime.

<sup>2</sup>Show  $\mathbb{C}[X_1, X_2, X_3]/I$  is a domain by simplifying the quotient.

- (7) Use the Strong Nullstellensatz to show that, in a finitely generated algebra over an algebraically closed field, every radical ideal can be written as an intersection of maximal ideals.