

PRIMITIVE ROOTS AND DISCRETE LOGARITHMS

PROPOSITION: Let  $p$  be a prime. Let  $p(x)$  be a polynomial of degree  $d$  with coefficients in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ . Then  $p(x)$  has at most  $d$  roots in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ .  $\square$

LEMMA (FROM HW): If  $G$  is a group,  $g \in G$ , and  $n$  a positive integer such that  $g^n = 1$ , then the order of  $g$  divides  $n$ .

DEFINITION: Let  $n$  be a positive integer. An element  $g \in \mathbb{Z}_n^\times$  is a **primitive root** if the order of  $g$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_n^\times$  equals  $\phi(n)$  (the cardinality of  $\mathbb{Z}_n^\times$ ).

THEOREM: Let  $p$  be a prime number. Then there exists a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$ .

(1) Warmup with primitive roots:

- (a) Check that  $[2]$  is a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_5$ .
- (b) Check that  $[3]$  is a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_4$ .
- (c) Find a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_7$ .
- (d) Show that there is no primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_8$ .

- (a)  $\varphi(5) = 4$  so we want order 4.  $[2]^1 = [2]$ ,  $[2]^2 = [4]$ ,  $[2]^3 = [3]$ ,  $[2]^4 = [1]$ , so the order of  $[2]$  is indeed 4.
- (b)  $\varphi(4) = 2$  so we want order 2.  $[3]^1 = [3]$ ,  $[3]^2 = [1]$ , so the order of  $[3]$  is indeed 2.
- (c)  $[2]$  doesn't work, since  $[2]^3 = [1]$ , but  $[3]$  is a primitive root.
- (d)  $[3]^2 = [5]^2 = [7]^2 = [1]$ , so nothing has order 4 =  $\varphi(8)$ .

(2) Suppose that  $g = [a]$  is a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ .

- (a) Show that<sup>1</sup> if  $0 \leq m \leq n < p - 1$ , and  $g^m = g^n$ , then  $m = n$ .
- (b) Show that every element of  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$  can be written as  $g^n$  for a unique integer  $n$  with  $0 \leq n < p - 1$ .
- (c) Show that the relation  $y \in \mathbb{Z}_p^\times \rightsquigarrow [m] \in \mathbb{Z}_{p-1}$  if  $y = g^m$  is a well-defined function  $I : \mathbb{Z}_p^\times \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}_{p-1}$ .

- (a) Let  $0 \leq m \leq n < p - 1$  and  $x^m = x^n$ . Then  $[1] = x^{-m}x^m = x^{-m}x^n = x^{n-m}$  and  $n - m < p - 1$ . Since the order of  $x$  is  $p - 1$ , we must have  $n - m = 0$ , so  $n = m$ .
- (b) From part (1),  $\{1, x, x^2, \dots, x^{p-2}\}$  are distinct elements of  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$ . Since this list has  $p - 1$  elements and  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$  does too, each element of  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$  must occur exactly once.
- (c) We need to show that if  $y = g^m = g^n$ , then  $[m] = [n]$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_{p-1}$ . Say  $m \leq n$ . If  $g^m = g^n$ , then  $1 = g^{n-m}$ , so by the lemma,  $p - 1 \mid n - m$ , and hence  $n \equiv m \pmod{p - 1}$ ; i.e.,  $[m] = [n]$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_{p-1}$ .

DEFINITION: If  $[a]$  is a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ , the function

$$\mathbb{Z}_p^\times \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}_{p-1} \quad [b] \mapsto [m] \text{ such that } [b] = [a]^m$$

is called the **discrete logarithm** or **index** of  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$  with base  $[a]$ .

(3) Let  $p$  be a prime and  $[a]$  a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ . Show that the corresponding discrete logarithm function  $I : \mathbb{Z}_p^\times \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}_{p-1}$  satisfies the property

$$I(xy) = I(x) + I(y) \quad \text{and} \quad I(x^n) = [n]I(x)$$

<sup>1</sup>Hint:  $x^m$  has an inverse.

for  $x, y \in \mathbb{Z}_p^\times$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Let  $x, y \in \mathbb{Z}_p^\times$ , and say that  $I(x) = [\ell]$  and  $I(y) = [m]$ . Then  $x = [a]^\ell$  and  $y = [a]^m$ . So,  $xy = [a]^\ell [a]^m = [a]^{\ell+m}$ , and hence  $I(xy) = [\ell + m] = I(x) + I(y)$ .  
 Similarly, since  $x^n = [a]^{\ell n}$ ,  $I(x^n) = [\ell n] = [n][\ell] = [n]I(x)$ .

- (4) (a) Verify that  $[2]$  is a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_{11}$  and compute the corresponding discrete logarithm.  
 (b) Use this function to find a square root of  $[3]$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_{11}$ .

(a) Compute the powers of  $[2]$ :

$n$	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
$[2]^n$	[1]	[2]	[4]	[8]	[5]	[10]	[9]	[7]	[3]	[6]	[1]

and  $[2]^{10} = [1]$ . The index function is just the inverse function:

$x$	[1]	[2]	[3]	[4]	[5]	[6]	[7]	[8]	[9]	[10]	[1]
$I(x)$	0	1	8	2	4	9	7	3	6	5	10

(b) Since  $I([3]) = 8$ , an element of index 4 would be a square root, so  $[5]$  is a square root.

PROPOSITION: Let  $n$  be a positive integer. Then  $\sum_{d|n} \varphi(d) = n$ .

THEOREM: Let  $p$  be a prime. Suppose that there are  $n$  distinct solutions to  $x^n = 1$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ . Then  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$  has exactly  $\varphi(n)$  elements of order  $n$ .

- (5) Explain how the theorem above implies that there exists a primitive root in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ .

By FLT, every element of  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$  is a solution to  $x^{p-1} = 1$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ , so the theorem applies. There are then  $\varphi(p-1)$  elements of order  $p-1$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$ . Since  $\mathbb{Z}_{p-1}^\times$  is nonempty,  $\varphi(p-1) > 0$ . Thus, there is a primitive root.

- (6) Proof of Theorem (using the Proposition): Fix a prime number  $p$ .  
 (a) We proceed by strong induction on  $n$ . What does that mean concretely here? Complete the case  $n = 1$ .  
 (b) Suppose that  $x^n = 1$  but the order of  $x$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$  is not  $n$ . What does the Lemma say about the order of  $x$ ? Rephrase this in terms of  $x$  satisfying an equation.  
 (c) Suppose that  $d$  is a divisor of  $n$ , and write  $n = de$ . Note that

$$x^n - 1 = (x^d - 1)(x^{d(e-1)} + x^{d(e-2)} + \dots + x^d + 1).$$

In particular, every solution of  $x^n - 1$  is a root of  $x^d - 1$  or of  $x^{d(e-1)} + x^{d(e-2)} + \dots + x^d + 1$ . Can  $x^d - 1$  have more than  $d$  roots in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ ? Can  $x^d - 1$  have less than  $d$  roots in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$  if  $x^n - 1$  has  $n$  roots?

- (d) Apply the induction hypothesis to show that the number of solutions to  $x^n = 1$  of order less than  $n$  is  $\sum_{d|n, d \neq n} \varphi(d)$ .  
 (e) Apply the Proposition to conclude the proof of the Theorem.

(a) We must show that it is true for  $n = 1$  and that if, for each  $d < n$ , if  $x^d = 1$  has  $d$  distinct solutions then there are  $\varphi(d)$  elements of order  $d$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$ , then if  $x^n = 1$  has  $n$  distinct

solutions then there are  $\varphi(n)$  elements of order  $n$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$ . Henceforth, we will assume that, for each  $d < n$ , if  $x^d = 1$  has  $d$  distinct solutions then there are  $\varphi(d)$  elements of order  $d$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_p^\times$ .

- (b) The order of  $x$  divides  $n$  in this case. That is,  $x$  is a root of  $x^d - 1$ .
- (c) No, by the first theorem,  $x^d - 1$  cannot have more than  $d$  roots in  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ . If  $x^n - 1$  has  $n$  roots, note that  $x^{d(e-1)} + x^{d(e-2)} + \dots + x^d + 1$  has at most  $d(e-1) = n - d$  roots. If  $x^d - 1$  had  $c < d$  roots, then  $x^n - 1$  would have at most  $c + (n - d) < d + n - d = n$  roots, contradicting the hypothesis.
- (d) The IH applies to every divisor  $d$  of  $n$ , so for each  $d | n$ ,  $d < n$ , we have  $\varphi(d)$  elements of order  $d$ .
- (e) The total number of solutions to  $x^n - 1$  is  $n$ . Every such solution either has order  $n$  or order  $d$  with  $d | n$  and  $d < n$ . Adding up all of the latter type gives

$$\sum_{d|n, d \neq n} \varphi(d) = \left( \sum_{d|n} \varphi(d) \right) - \varphi(n) = n - \varphi(n).$$

Thus, the number of solutions with order  $n$  is  $\varphi(n)$ .

(7) Proof of Proposition:

- (a) Explain the following formula:

$$n = \sum_{d|n} \#\{a \mid 1 \leq a \leq n \text{ and } \gcd(a, n) = d\}.$$

- (b) Explain<sup>2</sup> why

$$\#\{a \mid 1 \leq a \leq n \text{ and } \gcd(a, n) = d\} = \varphi(n/d).$$

- (c) Finally, explain<sup>3</sup> why

$$\sum_{d|n} \varphi(n/d) = \sum_{d|n} \varphi(d)$$

and complete the proof.

- (a) Every integer between 1 and  $n$  occurs in exactly one of the sets on the right hand side.
- (b) Following the hint, the integers between 1 and  $n$  whose gcd with  $n$  is  $d$  correspond to integers between 1 and  $n/d$  that are coprime with  $n/d$ . The phi function counts the latter.
- (c) As  $d$  ranges through the divisors of  $n$ ,  $n/d$  goes through all of the divisors of  $n$ , obtaining each value once. Put together with the previous parts, the formula follows.

- (8) Let  $p, q$  be distinct odd primes. Show that there is no primitive root of  $\mathbb{Z}_{pq}$ : i.e., there is no element of order  $\varphi(pq)$  in  $\mathbb{Z}_{pq}^\times$ .

<sup>2</sup>Hint: You proved that if  $\gcd(a, n) = d$ , then  $\gcd(a/d, n/d) = 1$ ; also, if  $\gcd(b, n/d) = 1$ , then  $\gcd(bd, n) = d$ .

<sup>3</sup>Hint: As  $d$  ranges through all the divisors of  $n$ , so does  $n/d$ .